Abstract

This contribution analyses the importance given to gender in articles related to caregiving for older adults in five francophone newspapers (Le Soir, Le Devoir, Figaro, Libération and La Presse) across three countries (Belgium, France and Canada). Out of the 254 articles in our sample, less than a fifth (49) made any mention of gender. A closer analysis of the gender related contributions reveal that only 18 articles devote more than a line to the interaction between gender and caregiving activities and its multiple socio-economic consequences. This is highly surprising since women provide the bulk of caregiving efforts and are the ones facing difficulties due to the lack of governmental actions to assist with these functions. These consequences are well documented in the scientific literature and feature caregiving burnout, loss of employment and economic insecurity. This contribution features an analysis and some extracts from the 18 articles in question.

Keywords: caregiving; caregivers; older adults; social services; Belgium; France; Canada; newspapers.

Introduction

Industrialised countries are all experiencing some forms of population aging, most frequently conceptualized as having an increasing proportion of individuals aged 65 and above relative to younger cohorts. The primary causes of this demographic are well known: the “baby boom” of the post-world war II years was quickly followed by a “baby bust” with a sharp decline in birth rates. This was accompanied by steady increases in life expectancy (OECD, 2000). Other elements have also played an important role. For example, in many Eastern European countries, outmigration patterns following the transition from communism have accelerated this demographic shift towards an aging population (Coleman & Rowthorn, 2011; Nancu, Guran-Nica, & Persu, 2010).

This demographic shift, accompanied by slower economic growth, has led many international organizations and governments to seek measures to adapt or transform their welfare state to face changing socio-economic realities (OECD, 1999, 2000). It has also prompted multiple debates on the relationship between population aging and the size of the welfare state (Disney, 2007; Gee & Gutman, 2000; Razin, Sadka, & Swagel, 2002; Tepe & Vanhuysse, 2009). These demographic and socio-economic transformations, often resulting in the retraction of popular social policies, have had a particularly negative impact on women...
prompting further studies on the role of gender in contemporary welfare states (see for example, Bashevkin, 2002). Across most countries, multiple studies have emphasized the lack of support and social services to cater to a growing cohort of older adults (Lavoie, 2014). Family members, and most notably women who continue to perform most caregiving functions, have been filing the increasing gap between needs and the lack of support offered by the public sector.

Our contribution analyses the extent to which the gender dynamic surrounding caregiving issues in an aging population have been addressed in news media. As part of a larger project on the representation of caregivers in the news media, we collected newspaper articles from five francophone newspapers (Le Soir, La Presse, Le Devoir, Le Figaro, and Libération) over a period of 20 years (1994-2014) in three different countries (Belgium, Canada and France) and targeted those devoted to the subject of gender. Much to our surprise, the issue of gender and caregiving shines by its absence and caregiving is mostly presented as a “genderless” activity. Women are simply invisible in these debates. Out of the 254 articles on caregiving during this period, only 18 articles made reference to role of gender in giving caregiving support. 16 of those were in Canada, two in Belgium and none in France. During the entire time periods, there were ten years without articles on the subject.

This contribution is divided onto four sections. The first summarizes the place of gender within the comparative welfare state literature with a special emphasis on the role of caregiving in aging societies. The second provides discuss the importance of media attention and public policy. The third features a discussion on the method employed for this research featuring extracts from the articles discussing caregiving. The conclusion provides potential reasons behind the dearth of articles on gender and caregiving and offers avenues for further research.

**Gender and the Welfare State**

Until recently, gender represented a largely ignored dimension of analysis in comparative welfare studies. Debates on the creation and expansion of the welfare state typically focused on social spending and program development attributed largely to broad phenomenon such as the industrial revolutions and the importance of social partners. The highly popular *Three Worlds of Welfare Capitalism* (Esping-Andersen, 1990) inserts itself in this tradition by, for example, introducing a new creative way to conceptualize and measure welfare state generosity. However, it also became highly notorious for the ways in which it failed to account for gender differences (Lewis, 1992; Orloff, 1993; Sainsbury, 1994).

Lewis (1992) and Orloff (1993) provide salient critiques on the ways in which unpaid workers, mostly women, were forgotten from the *Three Worlds* due to their marginal position within the labour market. This acted as a catalyst triggering an impressive wave of contributions on the role of gender in welfare state analysis (Fraser, 1994; Koven & Michel, 1990; O’Connor, 1993; Sainsbury, 1999) to the point where an in-depth review of the welfare state literature demonstrated that studies on gender represent one of the three worlds of welfare state analyses (Pierson, 2000). Caregiving quickly became an important point of departure to understand welfare state configurations and the gendered impact of their policies. The focus of the comparative literature, however, remains strongly anchored in care strategies for children and those analysing older adults have received less scrutiny (Bettio & Plantenga, 2004, p. 95). A comprehensive treatment of this literature lies beyond the scope of this article, but few no-
Belgium and France share many characteristics in common with other continental European countries as part of the called conservative regime with the presence of “familialist” policies meaning that women are assumed to perform an informal caregiving role and social rights are primarily derived from the husband via payroll taxes (Esping-Andersen, 1999; Guo & Gilbert, 2007). This extends beyond the traditional household with, for example, Belgian grandmothers being amongst the most active caregivers in Europe (Bettio & Plantenga, 2004).

While typologies of welfare states have been hotly disputed, a recent article on familisation featuring a new cluster analysis and an extensive review of the existing literature demonstrate that Belgium and France remain in the same categories across nine classifications (Bambra, 2007; see also Bettio & Plantenga, 2004).

Belgium and France stand in opposition to social democratic and “de-familiasing” welfare states, such as Sweden, which benefited from the formalization of care in the forms of highly accessible public services. A recent analysis attempting to move beyond the paid/unpaid work narrative focused on whether or not care arrangements exhibit a family, geared towards the structure of the family and the gender division of labour, or welfare value bias, devoted to the provision of social services (Pfau-Effinger, 2005). France, despite benefiting from strong childcare access, is stuck in a conflict between these two care arrangement ideals with the enhancement of the social standing of motherhood and the promotion of births competing with the ideals of a dual breadwinner model (Pfau-Effinger, 2005).

Recent contributions have been more focused on the decline of the male breadwinner model and its impact on care and work (Lewis, 2001). Ongoing changes to traditional family structures and the necessity to have dual earner households to sustain a family wage within continental European welfare states result in the apparition of ‘new’ social risks affecting primarily women who must conjugate increasing participation in the labour market with a lack of adequate formal care arrangements (Palier, 2010; Taylor-Gooby, 2004).

In contrast, Canada belongs to the liberal family composed primarily of former British colonies such as the United States and Australia (O’Connor, Orloff, & Shaver, 1999). With social benefits being relatively marginal and geared towards alleviating poverty, the liberal regime is clearly “de-familialised” and the primary challenge is to afford the cost of formal care in the private sector (Esping-Andersen, 1999). The lack of affordable alternatives often creates a dynamic where men are fully engaged on the labour market while women pursues a part-time work and caregiver track (Pfau-Effinger, 2005) although socio-economic status matters greatly with high income earners being able to embrace a dual-income earner career (Esping-Andersen, 1999). The Canadian literature on caregiving has provided strong support to this thesis while emphasizing the shortcomings of the Canadian welfare state to provide sufficient formal care support (Chappell & Hollander, 2013).

A key weakness of typologies is that they tend to exaggerate the scope and extent of differences between countries featuring in each cluster. For the three countries under study (Belgium, Canada and France), it is worthwhile mentioning that the underlying principles upon which older adults benefit from social services to alleviate losses in autonomy are quite similar. In all three countries, some forms of financial assistance aim to compensate for the costs of seeking services outside the public realm. These are the allocation pour l’aide aux personnes âgées (Belgium), the allocation personnalisée d’autonomie and the means-tested allocation de solidarité aux personnes âgées (France), and the cheque emploi-service.
(Québec/Canada). In all three cases older adults can also benefit from healthcare services, primarily nursing ones, and some basic services such as cleaning and cooking. Both private and public providers provide these services in all three cases, which operate at the margins of their respective healthcare systems. Thus, as stated earlier, the coverage is sporadic and reliance on informal caregivers remains strong, which is becoming increasingly problematic due to the shared commitment to maintain older adults in their own domicile as long as possible. Recent European and Canadian studies have emphasised that this is also a desired objective for older adults, as long as this can be achieved without having to depend on their children (Masuy, 2010; Guberman et al., 2012).

It is important to note that all Canadian articles originate from Quebec newspapers, which is where most of the francophone population resides. Provinces, such as Quebec, have the primary policy responsibilities for the majority of issues surrounding caregiving for older adults. Intuitively, it may seem more appropriate to mention that Quebec, rather than Canada is the third case analysed in this article. However, as is the case with all Canadian provinces, care services have been developed within the framework of the Canadian Health Act, which specifies the conditions that must be fulfilled by provinces to receive federal funding. Inspired by the United Kingdom’s National Health Service, the Canadian health care system prioritises curative care resulting in a strong emphasis on hospital care, often at the expense of preventive health measures and social services. As a result, care policies operate at the margins of the health care system - with many services to older adults not covered by the Canadian Health Act - and, consequently, there are no substantial differences with regards to the issues facing caregivers since informal care remains crucial due to poor formal arrangements across Canada (Chappell & Hollander, 2013).

Similar conclusions apply to Belgium. Our articles originate from Le Soir and may thus ignore some concerns that are particular to the Flemish region. There is no explicit national policy or strategy for informal caregivers, and as stated above, public support takes mostly the form of modest financial assistance (Masuy, 2010, p. 63). Belgium is rapidly federalizing since 1993 and noticeable regional differences exist with regards to the support granted to older adults and caregivers. For example, the Flemish region has established a mandatory insurance against dependence and broad measures to facilitate staying at home while Wallonia has opted to build institutional support, such as respite centres, often initiated at the local level (Masuy, 2010, pp. 64-65).

**Gender and Caregiving in Aging Societies**

The absence of women in policy discourses is hardly new and it even confines to comparative analysis. Providing support to older adults to maintain or enhance their quality of life is increasingly considered a vital part of social programs offered by industrialized societies, especially within the context of aging populations. Beyond the desire of most older adults to remain at their domicile as long as possible, policies facilitating aging in place and avoid placement in a long term care facility are surfacing as governmental priorities across western countries (Déchaux, 1996; Lavoie et al., 2005). While these policies gather substantial support due to the expected reduction in costs provided by such a shift, these policy choices are also justified to counteract the negative impact of long term hospitalization: isolation, resignation, dependency and stagnation (Guberman, Maheu, & Maillé, 1991). However, while this...
shift favouring aging at home policies should result in an increase in human and financial resources devoted to social services, there is a widening gap between needs and resources allocated. For example, in Québec, public services to support older adults in their domicile cover only 8% of their needs (Lavoie, 2014) leaving seniors to seek assistance from family members, friends, community groups and the private sector.

As a result, within this difficult context, the enactment of an “aging at home” or an “aging in place” strategy involves a strong participation from family members. Studies on the subject underline that family support in fact equates caregiving support from women, most frequently as a partner, friend, daughter or daughter-in-law (Martin, 2003; Kempeneers & Van Pevenage, 2011; Chappell, 2011). The literature on caregiving is unequivocal that family caregiving is first and foremost an activity performed by women. Men perform mostly instrumental assistance such as home repair or usually step in when no female help is available (Chappell, 2011, p. 11). Although the underlying reasons behind these outcomes go beyond the confines of this study, this well-documented reality follows from the fact that women are the ones who are mostly involved in performing caregiving functions within households; they are thus the ones who are relied upon when additional familial responsibilities arise.

Informal caregiving has also important socio-economic and health consequences for the women who assume this role. There are important professional consequences such as refusing to accept a promotion, working fewer hours in the labour market and being absent from work more frequently (Fast et al., 2011). This in turn has a highly noticeable impact on retirement incomes, making women far more likely to depend on means-tested benefits and pension benefits derived from a husband (Marier & Skinner, 2008). Multiple studies have also emphasized negative impacts on the well being of caregivers such as declining physical health (Vitaliano, Zhand & Scanlan, 2003) and a higher propensity to suffer from psychological conditions such as stress, depressions (Turcotte, 2013). In sum, while rewarding, informal caregiving can also plant the seeds of a vicious circle with caregivers likely to depend strongly on informal care later on due to a precarious financial situation and poor health.

In line with the previous section on caregiving and the welfare state, we would expect two different dynamics with regards to the three cases under study despite the fact that all three countries face similar challenges resulting in informal caregivers playing an important role in the lives of older adults in need. First, in the case of Belgium and France, the erosion of the breadwinner model has been somewhat compensated by expanding formal care strategies, but these have mostly been geared towards childcare (Bettio & Plantenga, 2004, p. 102). Thus, recent developments do not seem to alter the place and traditional role granted to family members, primarily women, when it comes to caregiving for older adults. Second, in the case of Canada and contrary to the other two cases in this study, formal caregiving roles are not assigned to family members. This explains why various forms of informal caregiving arrangements are particularly popular in Canada. This even features an immigration program to recruit care workers predominantly from emerging countries such as the Philippines (Ferrer, forthcoming).

Gender, Caregiving and Media Framing

As discussed in the preceding sections, there is now a rich and thriving literature analysing the relationship the interplay between gender, the welfare state and aging societies. Many of
these research findings have led to explicit acknowledgement of policy issues surrounding the question of gender and caregiving. However, to what extent has this translated onto the public sphere and being reported by the media?

The role of the media occupies a privileged place in public policy and for many good reasons. First, issue attention matters a great deal in public policy since there is a strong correlation between the priorities reported in the media and the legislative agenda of policymakers (Jones & Baumgartner, 2004). Succinctly put, unless there is acknowledgement of societal problems, policy initiatives are unlikely to be initiated and policy entrepreneurs cannot put forth their proposals (Kingdon, 2003). Second, the media does not only report problems, but also shapes or frames the ways problems are being defined by attributing blame when policy problems are being constructed (Bacchi, 1999). Research demonstrates that the media plays an important role in depicting social groups in highly negative or positive lights, which facilitates the production of policies that target specific populations (Schneider & Ingram, 1993).

Third, the use of public information campaigns represent a potent policy instrument for governmental authorities seeking to achieve certain policy outcomes, but also to communicate political preferences to a broad audience with the hopes of engaging or stimulating debates on a question of importance for the government (Weiss & Tschirhart, 1994). The media plays a crucial role when such instrument is deployed since it is the primary conveyor of information and one conveyor likely to foster or hinder public engagement. Finally, there are growing concerns about the concentration of ownership of the media and its incidence on the diversity of views and opinions diffused (Gamson, Croteau, Hoynes, & Sasson, 1992; Gentzkow & Shapiro, 2010).

With debates surrounding an aging population expected to trigger a wide range of outcomes ranging from minor adjustments (Gee & Gutman, 2000) to generational storms (Kotlikoff & Burns, 2005), media analysis on the various policy issues surrounding aging have become more common. According to Quadagno (1989), the media played a key role in promulgating the presence of intergenerational conflicts, which frequently depicts older citizens as “greedy geezers”. Multiple studies also denote, for example, the pervasive presence of diverse forms of ageism across a wide range of medium such as television (Lee, Carpenter, & Meyers, 2007), magazines (Harwood & Roy, 1999), and newspapers (Lagacé, Laplante, & Davignon, 2011; Rozanova, 2010).

What to expect with regards to caregiving and older adults? To our knowledge, there is no study analysing the ways caregivers assisting older adults are portrayed in the media and, consequently, no comparative studies of newspapers across countries. Nonetheless, two basic expectations can be derived from earlier writings on aging in the media. First, research from many countries state that population aging is increasingly being discussed as a political economic problem featuring rising costs for social program and depicting seniors as becoming a burden (Lundgren & Ljuslinder, 2011; Rozanova, Northcott, & McDaniel, 2006). Thus, we would expect a large number of articles emphasizing how seniors are producing a burden on caregivers having difficulties navigating maintaining their status on the labour market. Based on the literature on the welfare state described above, differences in treatment should be noticeable between France and Belgium on the one hand, and Canada on the other. For the continental European countries, discussions should centre on the difficulties of reconciling traditional gender role with a transforming economy where public services remain marginal while Canadian articles should focus on the lack of public services and their costs. Second, with caregiving performed primarily by women and with media representa-
tion of women typically emphasizing domestic work (Collins, 2011), we expect a large number of articles discussing gender in articles focused on caregiving for older adults. However, these discussions should differ in the European and Canadian context. In the former, we expect articles to question or debate the traditional role given to family members, and most notably women, when it comes to caregiving. In Canada, the focus is likely to be on how the lack of governmental services triggers rising demands onto informal caregivers with those more likely to be performed by women.

The Invisible Women: Caregiving as a Genderless Activity

In order to test these arguments, we sought articles featuring caregivers for older adults published between 1994 and 2014 in five highly popular dailies in Belgium (Le Soir), France (Le Figaro, Libération) and Canada (La Presse, Le Devoir). Relying on the Eureka database, we searched for all newspaper contributions, including letters to the editors, devoted to the issue of caregiving for older adults. This includes a word search on the various ways to describe older adults (such as personnes âgées and retraités) and caregivers (such as aidants, proche aidant, and aidants naturels). This was followed by a close reading of all articles to ensure that, at the very least, a portion of each individual articles related to the subject of our inquiry. Among the 254 articles addressing caregiving for older adults, which in itself is quite surprising given the rising importance of population aging as a policy issue and the emphasis placed on aging at home, we first sought contributions featuring gender issues (forty-nine articles). Finally, after a first analysis, we kept those that devoted more than one line to this issue leaving us with small sample of eighteen articles.

A first screening of the articles reveals that nine articles were published in each decade under review, but we also noticed that there is no article on the intersection between gender and caregiving for older adults published in ten of the twenty-one years analysed (1994-2014). In addition, there is no article discussing the increasing role assumed by migrant workers or issues related to visible minorities performing caregiving roles. Finally, almost all articles are from Canada (sixteen out of eighteen) with only two from Belgium and none from France. In all the titles, only one makes explicit reference to gender. These results add support to comparative welfare studies cited earlier that place and assume large familial responsibilities when it comes to caregiving in Continental Europe. One of the two Belgian articles, published in 2011, is particularly revealing since it aims to provide a legal status to caregivers to protect their social rights, but fails to discuss how this might entrench women further onto an impossible reconciliation between caregiving and other realities, including participation onto the labour market. The lack of media consideration on the growing difficulties to conciliate work and caregiving for older adults, to name one of the most pressing issues, is shockingly surprising. As expected, however, Canadian articles focused strongly on the lack of public services and on the difficulties to find alternative solutions.

A further analysis of the context within which these articles feature in the newspaper provides also interesting insights. First, the International Women’s Day (March 8th) prompted some discussion on the caregiving role assumed by many women. As such, it is not surprising that this event would trigger a broader discussion on gender and public policy. For example, a short article summarizes a speech given by the Premier during an electoral campaign event:
“Coinciding with the International Women’s Day yesterday, André Boisclair opted to reveal electoral promises to seduce women’s voters. If he is elected, the leader of the Parti Québécois will invest $211 million during his mandate, most notably, to tackle women’s abuse and to supplement the assistance given to caregivers (75% of them are women)” (author translation) (La Presse, March 9 2007).

Second, five articles consist of op-ed or letters to the editors. They are mostly contributions made by professionals working with older adults, women’s non-profit organizations or families deploring the lack of support to cater to their needs. An Open letter to Pauline Marois (Quebec’s Premier) from Jean-Pierre Lavoie, a researcher at a public health agency, is representative of this sample:

“The priorities of the minister are actually conspicuously missing when it comes to offering support to the aidantes (caregiving women) since 75% of caregivers are in fact women. Will they continue to be utilized as a free human resource to reach the budgetary targets of the government?” (Le Devoir, 6 July 2000) (author translation).

Finally, the last thirteen articles originate from what we would call “traditional journalism” where a reporter decides to pursue a news story featuring a change in legislation or an event related to caregiving. Yet, gender issues are treated very superficially, often simply by stating that most caregivers are women. For example, Marc Tison, a journalist, completed a special report on informal caregivers emphasizing that “77% of caregivers are women. This figure reaches 82% for those aged 45 and below” (La Presse, 8 August 2004) (author translation).

Canada generates the overwhelming majority of articles. The shift to ambulatory care (virage ambulatoire), enacted by the provincial government in Québec, features prominently since it is the core subject in eight of the eighteen articles. This ambulatory shift represents a new policy orientation introduced in 1995, which aims to shorten hospital stays and develop medical and nursing services at home (Lavoie et Guberman, 2005). So far, the necessary resources to deploy this strategy are sorely lacking resulting in a loss of services to seniors and even a transfer of nursing responsibilities to caregivers. With women representing the vast majority of caregivers, they are the ones being hurt the most by the lack of financial and human resources to implement of this new policy. The articles from the sample tend to be highly critical of the government and on how it ignores caregivers.

This coverage on the consequences of the ambulatory shift began in earnest in 1996:

“Due to a lack of funds, the state relies increasingly on family members to care for a rising number of individuals with chronic conditions. Quite often, this added responsibility falls on a single person: a woman most of the time. Those working in the field call her an “aidante naturelle” (“natural” caregiving women) (La Presse, 19 May 1996) (author translation).

The use of the term “aidante naturelle” is particularly revealing since it assumes that women are the default caregivers. Another article on the ambulatory shift stresses the negative impact of the reform on women with the title “the ambulatory shift represents a step backward for women” (La Presse, 26 August 1996) (author translation). Other articles written to commemorate the International Women’s day stresses the “mirage” of the ambulatory shift in 1999 and the drift it creates for women in 2000. In 1998, in the same vein, a journalist in La Presse reports that “the ambulatory shift, by allowing patients to leave hospitals earlier, adds a burden to carers – most frequently women, it should be noted – despite the assistance
Conclusion

This comparative analysis of newspaper coverage of caregiving for older adults, with a lens on gender dynamics, reveals that women face a double invisibility. The first invisibility stems from the simple fact that they are clearly absent from francophone newspapers. When newspapers report their difficult conditions, it is precisely because they are the forgotten ones facing the consequences of policy choices – or lack thereof – made by governmental authorities. Hence, their invisibility extends also to the political arena.

More specifically, this article features three other notable findings. First, regardless of the country under study, there is an important gap between findings from research and what is being portrayed in newspaper. Research demonstrates that informal caregivers are predominantly women and they experience important challenges fulfilling this role alongside other family responsibilities and professional obligations. These can result in substantive and negative health and socio-economic consequences for caregivers with researchers raising alarm bells for changes in policies to address these ongoing challenges. Yet, this sense of urgency is sorely lacking in the news media; there is, in fact, hardly any coverage of this issue with only 18 articles out of 254 articles on caregiving for older adults – and even less once we remove letters to the editors - devoting more than one line to issues related to gender.

Second, within this near absentia in coverage, one would suspect difficulties to present any conclusion on the basis of the comparative analysis. Surprisingly, this is not the case since both countries with a familialist tradition (Belgium and France), where women are expected to fulfil informal caregiving role despite increasing pressures to participate more fully onto the labour market, stand out by having only two articles – from Belgium - on issues surrounding gender and caregiving issues for older adults over a period of 21 years! As in Sherlock Holmes’ famous investigation in Silver Blaze, this is a case where there is a lot to learn from the dog that does not bark at night. For example, no article challenges the underlying assumption that informal care for older adults is systematically assigned to women.

Finally, it is the enactment of a strategy – the so-called ambulatory shift - without the necessary resources to fulfil it that is at the origin of most newspaper coverage surrounding the issue of informal caregiving and gender in Canada. This is aligned with theoretical expectations derived from the comparative welfare state literature that criticism would be occurring mostly at the lack of private solutions to compensate for the lack of public services. However, it remains an open question whether a similar amount of coverage would have been found without the elaboration of a new strategy and the promise of a shift in emphasis on the part of governmental authorities.

With a growing number of industrialised societies facing the prospect of an aging population, often within the context of budgetary constraints preventing an expansion of social services, informal caregiving is likely to play an even more important role regardless of the welfare regime in place. These challenges are even more acute in a country like Romania, which also faces the consequences of an important emigration that is accelerating the process of population aging, and important financial challenges surrounding its pension and health insurance (Bodogai & Cutler, 2014). Hopefully, these issues will gain further prominence in the media,
which represent a typical first step to gather the needed attention to bring forth policy change. The public acknowledgment of the gender dimension of informal caregiving and its socio-economic consequences represents a pre-requisite to improve the well being of older adults while producing conditions allowing better conditions for caregivers.

References